

Reservation Policy in India

Constitutional Provisions, Social Justice, and
Political Dynamics

Arjun Y. Pangannavar

Reservation Policy in India: Constitutional Provisions, Social Justice, and Political Dynamics

Arjun Y. Pangannavar

JSS Arts, Science and Commerce UG and PG College, GOKAK-
591307, Karnataka



DeepScience

Published, marketed, and distributed by:

Deep Science Publishing, 2025
USA | UK | India | Turkey
Reg. No. MH-33-0523625
www.deepscienceresearch.com
editor@deepscienceresearch.com
WhatsApp: +91 7977171947

ISBN: 978-93-7185-488-7

E-ISBN: 978-93-7185-194-7

<https://doi.org/10.70593/978-93-7185-194-7>

Copyright © Arjun Y. Pangannavar, 2025.

Citation: Pangannavar, A. Y. (2025). *Reservation Policy in India: Constitutional Provisions, Social Justice, and Political Dynamics*. Deep Science Publishing. <https://doi.org/10.70593/978-93-7185-194-7>

This book is published online under a fully open access program and is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Non-commercial 4.0 International License (CC BY-NC 4.0). This open-access license allows third parties to copy and redistribute the material in any medium or format, provided that proper attribution is given to the author(s) and the published source. The publishers, authors, and editors are not responsible for errors or omissions, or for any consequences arising from the application of the information presented in this book, and make no warranty, express or implied, regarding the content of this publication. Although the publisher, authors, and editors have made every effort to ensure that the content is not misleading or false, they do not represent or warrant that the information, particularly regarding verification by third parties-has been verified. The publisher is neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations. The authors and publishers have made every effort to contact all copyright holders of the material reproduced in this publication and apologize to anyone we may have been unable to reach. If any copyright material has not been acknowledged, please write to us so we can correct it in a future reprint.

Preface

Author's Words

The eminent Indian thinkers did not have uniform views on 'Reservation to the Socially Disadvantaged class of society'. Mahatma Gandhi dreamt of 'Casteless India', so the reservation to Dalits would still worsen the evil caste system that would further damage the rights of the socially disadvantaged class; Vallabh Bai Patel forecasted that 'the reservation to Dalits would not be confined to only Dalits, in the future, every caste and tribe in the society would demand reservation, and share it that would damage the constitutional rights of Dalits in general merit quotas thereby it would once again isolate the Dalits and push back them to their original social status. But Dr. Babasaheb Ambedkar did not accept the ideology of Gandhi and Patel, and he argued that using reservations as a selective measure to assure justice to Dalits in the social, educational, economic, and political fields, so he incorporated the provisions of reservations in the Constitution of India. After long discussions on the Articles of the Constitution in parliament, the Constitution was adopted, and the reservation system came into operation from 1947, initially declaring 20% reservations to the Scheduled Castes.

"Reservation Policy in India: Constitutional Provisions, Social Justice, and Political Dynamics" is a research work on Dr. Ambedkar's policy and practice of reservation for the upliftment of the 'Untouchables and the Oppressed Classes and disgraced Tribes' as per the Poona Pact-1932; it focuses on the provisions of the Indian Constitution relating to reservation given to the Untouchables and the Disgraced Tribes, a community that has been exploited for centuries. The book consists of twelve chapters: they focus on the reservation policy of India, which includes the criteria for determining reservation as per the respective articles of the Constitution of India including the definitions of Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes, Other Backward Classes and Minorities, the conspiracies in various guises to deprive the beneficiaries of the reservation benefits given to the Untouchables and the Oppressed Classes and Tribes and to suppress them; the reports of the Indian Backward Classes Commission submitted from time to time, their attempt to make reservation a universal rather than a selective measure, and the observations and directions of the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India on those reports, the amendments to the Constitution of India relating to reservation, the 103rd Constitution Amendment Act-2019 and the Public Interest Litigations filed before the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India, arguments thereon, arguments and observations of the court; discrimination in the implementation of the reservation policy, reservation problems, adverse effects of political reservation on the Scheduled Castes, solutions to reservation problems, and a summary of reservation policy and practice are discussed. The then Home Minister, the Iron Man Sardar Vallabhbhai Patel, had convinced Hon'ble Dr. Babasaheb Ambedkar about the shortcomings of reservation i.e., everyone would claim reservation facility based on caste and creed that would marginalize the real beneficiaries in the future

course of time, but Dr. Babasaheb Ambedkar had rejected Hon'ble Patel's suggestion, considering it to be anti-reservation. But today, time is answering Hon'ble Patel's doubts; The conspiracies to distribute reservations like candy to all classes of people have already begun. There is no doubt that by distributing reservations based on population, the inflexible caste system has been further strengthened, and the soul of the Indian Constitution to build a caste-free society has been defeated. The work is useful for general readers, scholars, students, and researchers. It can also be a good reference book for researchers conducting research on India's reservation policy.

Gokak
2025

Prof. Dr. Arjuna Y. Pangannavar

Acknowledgements

I am grateful to my wife, Gouramma, my daughter Shwetha, my son Vishnuvardhan, and his wife Revathi and son Chinmaya for their cooperation in writing and publishing this work. I am also grateful to my parents, brothers, and sisters who have always been my blessings. I am also grateful to the hearts that have been the source of my writing power. I am also grateful to the late Dr. Rekha. Y. Nayak, who encouraged and inspired me to author books, poems, etc.

I am also grateful to the book publisher, printer, and all their staff who have published this book beautifully. I thank the readers who read this book with their hearts and share their experiences in advance.

Gokak
2025

Prof. Dr. Arjuna Y. Pangannavar

Dedicated To

Great Philosopher, Mentor, Sage Valmiki,
Mahatma Gandhi
and
Gem of Knowledge Babasaheb Ambedkar

Indebtedness To

Readers & All Agitators

Table of Contents

Chapter 1: Reservation Policy in India	1
Chapter 2: The Path of Reservation in India.....	4
Chapter 3: Definitions of Reserved Categories.....	11
Chapter 4: Conspiracies to deprive the constitutional rights and opportunities of the Original Scheduled Classes	18
Chapter 5: The Deadly Reports of Backward Classes Commissions.....	23
Chapter 6: Amendment Bills to the Reservation Clauses of the Indian Constitution.....	35
Chapter 7: Objection Cases seeking Constitutionality of the 103rd Amendment Act of the Constitution-2019.....	41
Chapter 8: Operational Discrimination in the Reservation Policy	52
Chapter 9: The Twists and Problems of caste-religion reservations: The issue of secularism.....	57
Chapter 10: Political Reservation: A Boon or A Curse for Dalits.	59
Chapter 11: Appropriate Solutions for Protecting the Constitutional Rights and Opportunities of the Original Dalits	64
Chapter 12: Concluding Views of the Reservation.....	71
References	76

Chapter 1: Reservation Policy in India

1. Introduction:

India, under its constitution, has given the constitutional rights and opportunities to the untouchable and exploited caste people (original Dalits) and disgraced tribes to enjoy reservations in social, educational, economic and political fields until they reach the social, educational, political and economic standards of living equal to those of the mainstream people, under the Poona Pact of 1932. Still, under the pretext of ‘social justice’, the rights of the untouchable and exploited castes and disgraced tribal people are being systematically suppressed, deprived, and looted. ‘Exploitation of Dalits by Dalits!’ reflects the disorganization of the untouchable and exploited caste and tribal people and the lack of proper leadership among them. The high-ranking government officials, cunning politicians, anti-reservation commissions, courts, tribunals, advisory boards, committees and power-hungry selfish Dalit leaders and the Dalit organizations founded and nurtured by them have made a mockery of India's reservation policy and made it a curse to them and the defeat of the untouchable and exploited caste and disgraced tribal people, which is the biggest failure of the country's constitution's promise at its preamble, an irreparable loss as well a great defeat of the 'Poona Pact'. The purpose of this article is to present to readers the path, successes, failures, and sorrows of India's reservation policy. The article aims to ensure that the government and its system, as well as political leaders, stand up to protect the constitutional rights of the untouchable and exploited castes and tribal people.

1.1. Reservation Policy Background:

The caste system is an integral part of Indian society; on the one side though the Brahmin person lost his Brahmanism due to change in his service status, he or she is not ready to give up his or her ‘Brahmin illusion’, similarly on the other side, even though the reservation helped the Dalits to attain higher status educationally, politically, economically and socially the Shudra is not prepared to give up his or her status or illusion of ‘Dalit’. But in this tug-of-war, the country is getting poorer. The reservation system is not a recent phenomenon, and it has been in place since prehistoric times.

Prehistoric evidence, such as the Vedas, Puranas, the epic Ramayana, and the Mahabharata, mentions references to the 'Varna-System'. The Varna-System was a system of occupational classification, and it was not harsh or rigid but adaptive. Those who knew the knowledge of the universe were called Brahmins, while those who served the common people were called Shudra-Varna. The term 'Varna' means the class or color code of occupation. Over time, the class code of occupation became the 'Family Occupation' whereby the family and its members were assigned or tagged a caste indicating their family profession or occupation, thus the caste system took birth in India, though it was born out of this hollow principle, continues to this day, which is a great tragedy of Indian society. The reservation policy based on the caste system was the beginning of the occupational classification. Similarly, the classification of humankind as Yaksha, Rakshas, Gandharva, Manav, Deva, etc. into distinct categories was born from this reservation policy. As time passed, as human morality changed, Vedanties like Manu wrote a table of clans and lineages (Genealogy), which introduced a harsh caste system in society. The definition of 'caste system' in astrology is different—the color of the body of a child born based on the zodiac sign, stars, and planets determines the color of the body, i.e., Brahmin, Kshatriya, Vaishya, and Shudra. But what has remained in practice so far is the inhumane caste system, which has been corrupted by caste; the anti-caste system lessons of the Ramayana and Mahabharata failed to uproot this social injustice. They always argue that caste comes not by birth but by occupation or work. The Bhagavad Gita's argument that a person is not great by birth but by karma died out, but in the course of time, these epics were also corrupted by including incidents and anecdotes that justified this social injustice.

To protect the weak from this irrational caste system, which was a weapon for the exploitation of the weak, a new concept of 'reservation' was born. In 1927, Periyar Ramaswamy, a Bida by clan, united all the exploited non-Brahmin castes of the Madras Province and founded an organization called 'Dravid Kazhagam' and started a movement demanding reservations to non-Brahmins in every field. This non-Brahmin movement opened the eyes of the British government in Madras, fearing the movement, the government announced the 'reservation policy' in 1929. The 'reservation policy' was the victory of Periyar Ramaswamy's movement. The people called Periyar Ramaswamy the 'Father of Reservation'. At the same time, elsewhere, the mouthpiece of the exploited Dalit class and the unique leader Dr. Bhimrao (Bheevaram) Ambedkar had long placed before the British government the demands of a separate 'voter list' and 'settlement' area for the Dalits, who were exploited by the upper castes in the country; Muslims and other minorities in the country already had these facilities. British Prime Minister Ramsay MacDonald had accepted Ambedkar's demands. At the same time, Mahatma Gandhi, who was in Yerawada Jail in Pune, started a fast to protest these demands. For the justification of his protest, M. K. Gandhi opined that Dalits were already being exploited by being confined in separate camps or outcaste areas due to the untouchable social system, but such demands would further alienate Dalits from mainstream society, so the

Chapter 2: The Path of Reservation in India

1. Introduction: The word "Reservation" was originally derived from the word "To Spare." Reserving means to spare for someone. To Spare is not new to India; for a long time, Indians have been cultivating, practicing, and protecting the 'reservation system' as a social heritage. In another sense, the reservation system has grown into a social phenomenon among Indians. When cooking at home, a portion of food is kept aside for offering to God before the meals. Similarly, the social heritage and mentality of keeping aside offerings for the deceased elders of the family, and leaving aside offerings for the Mother Earth, are prevalent in the Indian social system. Similarly, the government also reserves some land and resources for some specific purposes. The sole purpose of this reservation system is to achieve specific goals. Like this reservation-preserving social psychological condition, the "inhuman caste system" is also a social psychological condition, which has become a deadly plague to society. It is the family tradition of occupation that has given rise to the "inhuman caste system" and is universally agreed upon. A harsh social classification arose, with the children of Brahmins being Brahmins, and the children of Shudras being Shudras. This problem is also mentioned in the great epic, Valmiki Ramayana of the Treta Yuga. In the Uttara Kanda of Ramayan, when King Rama held a meeting to find out the reason for the untimely death of a Brahmin boy in his kingdom, there was a discussion on Yuga Dharma (Code of conduct of the era or Constitution of era). The ancient poet Valmiki stated that the Varna system is a system of labour division, which is not rigid and fixed, but adaptable. The ancient poet Valmiki has stated the principle that a person who has attained universal knowledge, whether a Kshatriya, Vaishya, or Shudra, becomes a Brahmin. However, due to the unchanging social mentality, the caste determination system from birth remains alive. Low-level occupations such as tailoring, leather work, barbering, pottery, prostitution, labor, agricultural labour, etc. pushed those employees to the untouchable, exploited, and humiliated caste and ethnic groups, which turned into a social mentality as a caste system. Even in the present time, we see this social mentality among the people. For example, the children of doctors, becoming doctors, men and women in the medical profession getting married, doctors forming their own social organization, institutions, organizing social programs, etc., have emerged as a new form of the questionable 'caste system' that is neo-varnashrama, similarly the children of government employees, I A.S.,

Chapter 3: Definitions of Reserved Categories

1. Introduction: The British during their rule in India conducted a census in 1881, according to which they classified the population of India into five categories based on caste, tribe and religion, namely (1) Brahmin, (2) Kshatriya, (3) Other Hindu castes and tribes: to be named (a) Vokkaliga (agriculturists), (b) Lingayat, (c) Kuruba (shepherds), (d) Beda, (e) Golla (cattle herders), (4) Non-Hindu castes and tribes: to be named (a) Holaya, (b) Madiga, and (5) Muslims (Sunni). According to the 1881 census, the Holaya and Madiga castes were considered non-Hindu castes, but the same category was also considered untouchable. During the freedom struggle and post-independence period, an attempt was made to provide reservations to the same untouchable, exploited, and humiliated tribes to bring them into the mainstream of the country and civil society. The term 'Shudra caste' was not used in the 1881 census. So, did the Shudra class in the Chaturvarna system exclude the 'Holaya' and Madiga castes? Doesn't Dr. Ambedkar's declaration that he was born a Hindu, and he had no control over it, but he would not die a Hindu, seem meaningless in the context of the 1881 census?

According to a study by Bhimasen Hantal (2007), "After independence, the reservation policy became more open and explicit due to the justification of the Indian Constitution. There is a need for a definition of the terminology of the Scheduled Castes (SC), Scheduled Tribes (ST), and Other Backward Classes (OBC) communities, which are the main claimants and beneficiaries of the reservation policy." The correct definitions of these terms, SC (Scheduled Castes), ST (Scheduled Tribes), and OBC (Other Backward Classes) play a key role in implementing the promise of 'economic and social justice' by the Indian Constitution. Several other terms play a crucial role.

1.1 Schedule Caste:

The word 'Schedule' means 'list' or 'list in a Table.' The word 'caste' means 'birth-clan' or 'household of birth.' The social status of clans or families depended on their clan occupations, but in the Chaturvarna system, the caste classification was initially flexible. There are examples in Indian history where the Shudras ruled many states or nations. Almost all rulers in South India were tribals and Shudras. Over time, the caste classification was made rigid for self-respect or selfish reasons.

Chapter 4: Conspiracies to deprive the constitutional rights and opportunities of the Original Scheduled Classes

1. Introduction: The Untouchables and the Depressed and Oppressed Tribes are the Main Schedulers or eligible beneficiaries of the reservation policy. They were defined as ‘Dalits’ by Dr. Ambedkar; they were called ‘Harijan’ and ‘Girijan’ respectively by Mahatma Gandhi, the Constitution of India has defined them as ‘Scheduled Castes’ and ‘Scheduled Tribes’ respectively. The constitutional rights and opportunities of such people are being stolen by the unworthy through various conspiracies, some are being bereaved through the front door, and some are being bereaved through the back door.

1.1. Inter-Caste Marriage: The caste of any person is derived from his/her birth,’ it is a legal and constitutional argument; it has been referred to by the High Court and the Supreme Court in several judgments, for instance M adhuri Patil case, 1994/ 6 SCC 241. Suppose any Scheduled Caste/Tribe person marries any Non-Scheduled Caste/Tribe person, he/she continues to belong to his/her original Scheduled Caste/Tribe. But, if any Non-Scheduled Caste/Tribe person marries any Scheduled Caste/Tribe person, he/she continues to belong to his/her original caste, and he/she does not become a Scheduled Caste/Tribe caste. The caste of children born from marriages between Scheduled and Non-Scheduled persons depends on the social environment and caste-religion they are in: if their children grow up in a Scheduled Caste social environment, they are considered Scheduled Caste/Tribe, if they grow up in a Non-Scheduled Caste social environment, they are not considered Scheduled Caste/Tribe.

Many ineligible individuals have obtained Scheduled Caste/Tribe certificates based on such inter-caste marriages and have obtained reservation facilities in politics, employment and education, which is a case of fake/bogus caste certificate and it is punishable under Section 177 & 182 of the Indian Penal Code(replaced by section 217 of BNS); the increase in such crimes is due to the government's revenue department, social welfare department and MLAs, MPs and ministers; The government should voluntarily form a committee from time to time to investigate cases of fake/forged caste

Chapter 5: The Deadly Reports of Backward Classes Commissions

1. Introduction: The desire of the Indian Constitution to provide social and economic equality to the untouchables and exploited castes and tribes, and the dream of the Dalits of the architect of the Constitution, Bharat Ratna Dr. Babasaheb Ambedkar, is being shattered, including the evil role of the Backward Classes Commissions appointed by the government from time to time.

1.1.Kaka Saheb Kalelkar Commission, 1953

Although Article 15(4) of the Indian Constitution uses the qualifying terms ‘socially and educationally’, the lack of their definition has become a major obstacle for the government to define the term ‘backward classes’. The thought that ‘it is not justifiable to target and list the Scheduled Castes and Tribes based on the Hindu religion alone because there are backward communities in non-Hindu religions as well’ was strongly expressed. Recently, between January 9-12, 2019, the Bharatiya Janata Party-led central government, without appointing any commissions to conduct surveys and study, without receiving reports and recommendations from any commissions, and without prior discussion, suddenly introduced the 124th Amendment Bill to Articles 15 and 16 of the Constitution of India in the Lok Sabha on January 9 and got a majority. In the Rajya Sabha on January 10, it got a majority. On January 12, it got the President's signature and was published in the Gazette on the same day, implementing 10% reservation for the upper caste poor as ‘Economically Weaker Section’ (EWS) and providing them reservation for promotions in the service; the bill, which came into force in just four days, created new history, on the other hand, it also became a history of abuse of power and rape in broad daylight of the Constitution of India. The amendment of Article 15(6) has repeatedly become a weapon of politicians who create vote banks. By using this weapon, the constitutional rights and opportunities of the Scheduled Castes and Tribes were snatched away. Specifically, 27% of the OBC and 10% of the Upper Caste Poor

Chapter 6: Amendment Bills to the Reservation Clauses of the Indian Constitution

1. Introduction: In order to achieve the goal of providing social, economic and political equality to the untouchables, exploited and humiliated tribal communities, Babasaheb Ambedkar, amidst opposition, urged the government to implement the 'class-based reservation system' within a time frame by incorporating it in the Constitution (Article 334), and accordingly, 'Babasaheb's 'class-based reservation system' was implemented with the unopposed consent of the Constitution in Parliament; But the Mandal Report, which came into effect in 1993, on the one hand, replaced Babasaheb's 'class-based reservation system' with 'caste-based reservation system', indirectly strengthening the 'unruly caste system', and on the other hand, instead of ending the 'reservation system' by giving equality to the socially unjust class with the 'abolition of the caste system', it created 'Other Backward Classes' to push the socially unjust class back to its previous status and 'perpetuated the reservation system'; by increasing the vertical reservation groups, we were dividing the country and society, which was a threat to the unity of the country and society. The Constitution has been amended several times to strengthen the vertical reservation system, the main amendment being:

1.1. Article 338 of the Constitution of India and the Amendment Act:

1949-Constitution of India Article 338 provides that (1) The President shall appoint Special Officers for the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes, (2) The Special Officer shall inquire into matters relating to the protection of the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes and shall submit a report directly to the President, such report being sent to the Lok Sabha, (3) The President may interpret the references to 'Other Backward Classes' and Anglo-Indian Community as if they were references to the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes as reported by the Commission appointed under Article 340(1).

In 1987, the 'National Commission for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes' was constituted as per the resolution of the Government of India, and in this regard, the Commission was considered as a constitutional body through the 65th Amendment Act of 1990. In 2003, Article 333-A was added to the Constitution by the 89th Amendment

Chapter 7: Objection Cases seeking Constitutionality of the 103rd Amendment Act of the Constitution-2019

1. Introduction: To provide economic reservation for non-reserved castes in the country, the majority government at Centre announced the Constitution Amendment Bill 124, Bill No. 3, on January 8, 2019, and the next day, on January 9, it was introduced in the Lok Sabha and approved. The next day in the Rajya Sabha, the 103rd Constitution Amendment Act was approved by the Honourable President and came into force on January 14. This is the first time in its history that an amendment law has been passed so quickly, and its intensity makes its purpose clear. At the same time, a non-governmental social organization, 'Youth for Equality', filed a public interest litigation in the Supreme Court challenging the constitutionality of the economic reservation law.

The 103rd Constitutional Amendment Act, 2019, provided for 10% reservation in education, employment and promotion for the non-reserved poor, i.e. Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes and Other Backward Classes, excluding the Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes and Other Backward Classes, by inserting Articles 15(6) and 16(6) of the Constitution of India. It also mandated the state governments to implement it. To identify the economically weaker sections or categories, (a) it fixed the annual family income limit at Rs 8 lakh or less than 5 acres of agricultural land, (b) they should not be beneficiaries of any reservation, (c) they should not have a house measuring more than 1000 sq ft or a plot measuring more than 100 yards and (d) they have a residential house measuring less than 200 yards in a non-scheduled municipality.

1.1. Consequences of the 103rd Amendment Act:

(a) The 103rd Amendment Act, by inserting Articles 15(6) and 16(6) of the Constitution, provided 10% reservation for the economically weaker sections, thereby taking away the constitutional rights and opportunities of the Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes, and Other Backward Classes from the general category quota.

(b) The total reservation quota limit was increased from 50% to 60%, thus violating the direction of the 50% reservation limit given by the Hon'ble Supreme Court.

Chapter 8: Operational Discrimination in the Reservation Policy

1.Introduction: Someone gets lime, some other colour. The reservation itself has become a bitter enemy for the untouchables and the exploited class. The 10% reservation for the poor upper caste category (EWS) has snatched away the constitutional opportunities and rights of the untouchables and the exploited class. Does that make sense to those who drink poison? Have the Dalit liberals, who are wise enough to believe that everyone will get a reservation, understood the purpose of the reservation?

1.2. The Reservation Discrimination: When we think of reservations, only the Scheduled Castes and the Scheduled Tribes immediately come to mind. For the last 70 years, there have been more people who have been jealous of SC and ST reservations. But today, people of all non-Scheduled castes and religions are getting the same reservation means almost all castes and religions are covered under the reservation system, but the hatred and atrocities against Dalits have not come to an end. In Karnataka, the Scheduled Castes and Tribes get only 18% (Scheduled Castes-15%+Scheduled Tribes-3%) reservation, while the Non-Scheduled Castes get 42% (OBCs-32% + EWS-10%) reservation. Now, doesn't the same mean-minded reservation question their souls? Wasn't the Supreme Court's guidance and order that imposed the 50% reservation ceiling violated?

Why did the country's esteemed Supreme Court, which has the attitude that "merit is ruined by reservation," tolerate the violation of its bench-judgment guidelines today? Don't the Central and State Governments bring 10% EWS reservation in the name of the poor, ruin merit and efficiency? Does a reservation only for Scheduled Castes and Tribes ruin merit and efficiency? The merit quota has now been reduced from 50% to 40%. Won't it hurt the judiciary, executive, and legislature? What is the truth behind this? Recently, the Scheduled Castes and Tribes candidates have been selected in large numbers through competitive examinations in merit quotas, so the Scheduled Castes and Tribes were getting more selection opportunities from the both merit and reservation quotas, this development has created fear among the upper castes; due to which the upper

Chapter 9: The Twists and Problems of caste-religion reservations: The issue of secularism

1. Introduction: From the 1990s, everyone has wanted to get a reservation on a caste basis in the guise of poverty in all fields in India. Dr. Ambedkar had the logic of using class-based reservation as a tool to enable the socially disadvantaged class to get justice in all fields, to join the mainstream of civil society. The recent trends developed in getting a reservation once again take the society to a deep-rooted neo- caste system in the guise of the four categories of reservation, namely SCs, STs, OBCs, and EWS. It has threatened the secular features of the Constitution of India.

1.1. Caste-Based Vote bank Politics jeopardizes Secularism: A new religious chant has been used to bring every caste in the orbit of reservation showing them the dream of “Equal Share, Equal Life”. ‘Buddham Sharanam Gachhami’ means a person who surrenders to intellect can become a world-builder, but that intellect must be for the benefit of the common people. Saying unpleasant and unspeakable words as if he has intellect shows the level of intelligence of a person; speech protects the health of society, but also destroys it; speech is a lamp, a tool to make everyone laugh, a way of speaking, practicing (Dharma or Code of Conduct) and also a precious thing; one who knows how to speak does not quarrel with others; in a secular country like India, they have the right to freedom of religion according to the Constitution, but no one has the right to suppress and abuse the religion of others: children studying in school know that very well !!!, it doesn’t require extra Caliber.

‘Sangam Sharanam Gachhami’ means Coexistence, the one who surrenders to society-being-lives can build a better society. As Karl Marx said, benefits arise with the help of society or the community, not from an individual, so the distribution of those benefits should be done to everyone in society according to their ability or contribution. Without society, an individual has no value. Being part of society means following its rules and regulations (Dharma); if an individual practices arbitrariness or acts without regard for the law, it is considered anarchy (doing as one likes). The arbitrariness practiced in the

Chapter 10: Political Reservation: A Boon or A Curse for Dalits.

1. Introduction: Whether 'Reservation' is a boon or a curse to Dalits! Has Reservation become a Bhasmasur-boon, i.e., a curse to the Scheduled Castes and tribes? The seven decades of practical experience have proven that reservation became a boon to the better off or bullish few Dalit families and persons, but it is rather a curse to the weak Dalits; the reservation failed to uplift the deserving Dalits to join the mainstream of the civilized world. There is co-existence of a few better-off Dalit families and a great number of hapless and deplorable Dalit families. Reservation is a curse disguised as a boon to most Dalits who are prone to untouchability and exploitation.

1.2. Political Reservation, A Curse to Dalits: The era of political reservation in India was initiated by the British government under the Indian Council Act of 1909, which granted the Muslim community's demand for representation in the administration along with Hindus; Muslims demanded separate electoral rolls and constituencies for them. Some Muslim leaders had the fear of not getting representation in the administration where Hindus are dominant in size of population. Here, the actual intent of the reservation is to provide opportunity to those who are minor in population size. The same intent of the reservation continued even after 1947 till 2008, the Delimitation Act enactment; the Delimitation Act 2008 has changed view from small size to big size of population. i.e., it reserved the constituency for the SC community where the size SC community population is higher; it is unjust because it prevents the SC community from being represented in the general category constituencies. This new method of identifying reserve constituencies deprives them of their fundamental rights in general constituencies and thereby limits their representation strength to their reservation constituencies. Presently, 131 MPs from SC and ST constituencies did not utter a word against it, so the political reservation failed to protect and safeguard the interests of SCs and STs. It spoiled Dr. Ambedkar's intent of political reservation.

Chapter 11: Appropriate Solutions for Protecting the Constitutional Rights and Opportunities of the Original Dalits

1. Introduction: The 'One Nation, One Reservation Category' policy must be introduced. If there is a need to continue the caste- religion-based reservation system in the country, even after seven decades of independence, there is a need for a change in the approach to the criteria to identify the deserving beneficiaries of the reservation system.

1.2: Appropriate Solutions: The present four categories reservation system over overburdened with many twists and problems that hinder the deserving beneficiaries of it. Some appropriate solutions are discussed as under:

(i) Uniform Reservation System: The list of reservation quotas, castes, tribes, and alternative terms of the central government is not uniform from state to state, from the Central government to the state. For example, the reservation quota for Scheduled Tribes in Karnataka is 3%, whereas it is 7.5% at the centre, while in Uttar Pradesh, the Valmiki tribe is in the Scheduled Caste list, whereas in Karnataka, it is in the Scheduled Tribe list, and states like Tamil Nadu, Andhra Pradesh, and Maharashtra, it is in the Other Backward Classes (OBC) list. Due to such contradictions, the Scheduled Castes and Tribes have not received social justice even today. The untouchables and the exploited class, and criminal tribes are still far from the mainstream of civil society; in India, everywhere, they are facing a similar socio-economic, educational, and political situation. If there is a political will to fulfil the socio-economic justice aspirations of the Constitution of India, a uniform reservation system should be implemented in the country. Under a uniform reservation system, the Scheduled Caste reservation quota should be 18% in all states, union territories, and the Centre, and the Scheduled Tribe category reservation quota should be 7.5%. The Scheduled Caste Tribes identified by the Centre should be the list of caste tribes of the state government and all the alternative words should be brought under a single heading-word or title-term, and they should also be included in the main list, for example, if Valmiki tribe is the main word, its alternatives are Bedar, Beda, Berad, Nayaka, Nayaka etc.

Chapter 12: Concluding Views of the Reservation

India, under its Constitution, has given the constitutional rights to the people of the untouchable and exploited communities, as per the Poona Pact 1932, to enjoy reservation in all these fields until they reach the social, educational, political and economic standards of living equal to those of the mainstream people. Still, under the pretext of ‘social justice’, the rights of the people of the untouchable and exploited communities are being systematically suppressed, deprived, and looted. The highest ranking government officials, cunning politicians, anti-reservation commissions, courts, tribunals, advisory boards, councils and power-hungry, selfish Dalit leaders and Dalit organizations have made a mockery of the Constitution and the reservation policy of India, and making it a curse instead a blessing for the people of the untouchable and exploited communities, which is the biggest disaster, irreparable damage and a great defeat of the ‘Poona Pact’ for the country. The 123rd and 124th amendments brought to the Constitution of India in 2019 are the worst examples.

The reservation system is not recent but has been in practice since prehistoric times. There are references to the ‘Chaturvarna-System’ (color-coded-based four-class system) in prehistoric evidence such as the Vedas, Puranas, the epic Ramayana, and the Mahabharata. The Chaturvarna-Varna was a system of occupational classification, and it was adaptive. The one who knew the knowledge of the universe was a Brahmin, and the one who served the common people was a Shudra; over time, the family and profession of the child were assigned a caste, which was a great tragedy of Indian society. The caste-based job classification and reservation policy began. The lessons of the Ramayana and Mahabharata were successful in uprooting this social injustice, but those epics were also corrupted by adding episodes and anecdotes to justify this social injustice.

A new concept of ‘reservation’ was born to protect against this irrational caste system, which was a weapon for the protection of Dalits. In 1927, Periyar Ramaswamy of the Beda tribe united all the exploited non-Brahmin castes of the Madras region and founded an organization named ‘Dravid Kazhagam’ and started a movement demanding reservations for the non-Brahmin community. This non-Brahmin movement opened the

References

1. Ganguly, Debjani; Docker, John (2008), *Rethinking Gandhi and Nonviolent Relationality: Global Perspectives*, Routledge, pp. 4–, ISBN 978-1-134-07431-0
2. Parel, Anthony J (2016), *Pax Gandhiana: The Political Philosophy of Mahatma Gandhi*, Oxford University Press, pp. 202–, ISBN 978-0-19-049146-8
3. Stein, Burton (2010), *A History of India*, John Wiley & Sons, pp. 289–, ISBN 978-1-4443-2351-1
4. McGregor, Ronald Stuart (1993). *The Oxford Hindi-English Dictionary*. Oxford University Press. p. 799. ISBN 978-0-19-864339-5.
5. Gandhi, Rajmohan (2006). *Gandhi: The Man, His People, and the Empire*. p. 172. ISBN 978-0-520-25570-8
6. Gandhi, Mohandas K. (2009). *An Autobiography: The Story of My Experiments with Truth*. p. 21. ISBN 978-1-77541-405-6.
7. S. N. Mishra (2010). *Socio-economic and Political Vision of Dr. B.R. Ambedkar*. Concept Publishing Company. p. 96. ISBN 978-8180696749.
8. Keer, Dhananjay (1971). *Dr. Ambedkar: life and mission (Third ed.)*. Mumbai India: Popular Prakashan. p. 20. ISBN 81-7154-237-9.
9. Kshīrasāgara, Rāmacandra (1994). *Dalit Movement in India and Its Leaders, 1857–1956*. M.D. Publications Pvt. Ltd. ISBN 978-8185880433. Retrieved 2 November 2016 – via Google Books.
10. Thorat, Sukhadeo; Kumar, Narender (2008). *B. R. Ambedkar: perspectives on social exclusion and inclusive policies*. New Delhi: Oxford University Press.
11. "Ambedkar vs Gandhi: A Part That Parted". *Outlook*. 20 August 2012. Archived from the original on 27 April 2015. Retrieved 29 April 2015
12. Sheth, D. L. (November 1987). "Reservations Policy Revisited ". *Economic and Political Weekly*. 22 (46): 1957–1962. JSTOR 4377730.
13. P M Bakshi (2007): "The Constitution of India " Universal Law Publication Co, Pvt Ltd Delhi, ISBN 1-7734-499-7
14. Soren, Chunuram (May 2022). "Reservation In India: Rhetoric and Reality". *International Journal of Advanced Research*. 10 (5).
15. *Reservation Brochure (PDF) (Report)*.
16. "Judgement Writ Petition (Civil) No.930 of 1990 – Indira Sawhney Versus Union of India And others (16.11.1992)" (PDF). National Commission for Backward Classes. Retrieved 5 November 2011.
17. "Quotas for poor among 'forward castes' upheld: Here's the case and what the SC has ruled". 7 November 2022.
18. "Supreme Court upholds EWS quota in 3-2 split verdict, CJI in minority". *The Times of India*. 8 November 2022.

19. *"Reservation policy cannot stay for indefinite period, says Supreme Court". The Hindu. 7 November 2022.*
20. *"Validity of Sub-Classification Within Reserved Categories". Supreme Court Observer. Retrieved 25 September 2024.*
21. *"Sub-Classification Within Reserved Categories | Judgement Summary". Supreme Court Observer. Retrieved 25 September 2024.*
22. *"Sub-Classification Within Reserved Categories | Judgement Matrix". Supreme Court Observer. Retrieved 25 September 2024.*
23. *"BJP's OBC pitch: How stronger new backward classes panel will function". The Indian Express. 18 April 2017.*
24. *"Seventy Seventh Amendment". Indiacode.nic.in. Retrieved 19 November 2011.*
25. *"Eighty Fifth Amendment". Indiacode.nic.in. 4 January 2002. Retrieved 19 November 2011.*
26. *"Eighty First Amendment". Indiacode.nic.in. 29 August 1997. Retrieved 19 November 2011.*
27. *"Eighty Second Amendment". Indiacode.nic.in. Retrieved 19 November 2011.*